

Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS)

On the Parliamentary Oversight of the State Military Organisation



Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces

 Geneva Centre for Democratic Control of Armed Forces (DCAF)

COMMONWEALTH OF INDEPENDENT STATES

MODEL LAW

ON THE PARLIAMENTARY OVERSIGHT OF THE STATE MILITARY ORGANISATION

Edited by Philipp Fluri and Alexander Nikitin

2012

Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces (DCAF) www.dcaf.ch

The Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces is one of the world's leading institutions in the areas of security sector reform (SSR) and security sector governance (SSG).

DCAF provides in-country advisory support and practical assistance programmes, develops and promotes appropriate democratic norms at the international and national levels, advocates good practices and makes policy recommendations to ensure effective democratic governance of the security sector.

DCAF's partners include governments, parliaments, civil society, international organisations and the range of security sector actors such as police, judiciary, intelligence agencies, border security services and the military.

COMMONWEALTH OF INDEPENDENT STATES (CIS)

MODEL LAW

ON THE PARLIAMENTARY OVERSIGHT OF THE STATE MILITARY ORGANISATION

Edited by Philipp Fluri and Alexander Nikitin

Geneva, 2012

Philipp Fluri and Alexander Nikitin, eds., *On the Parliamentary Oversight of the State Military Organisation: CIS Model Law*, Second edition (Geneva: Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces, 2012).

© Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces, 2012 Executive publisher: Procon Ltd., http://www.procon.bg Cover design: Angel Nedelchev ISBN 978-92-9222-207-9

PREFACE

The Model Law on Parliamentary Oversight of the State Military Organisation was first adopted by the CIS Parliamentary Assembly in its 18th Plenary Session (Resolution No.18-13 of 24th November 2001). It has long been out of print and available in electronic form only. DCAF is delighted to again make present it to the public in printed form 10 years after it was first made available.

The cooperation with the CIS Parliamentary Assembly, aptly facilitated by the Moscow-based Center for Political and International Studies directed by Prof. Aleksandr I. Nikitin, was among the most successful and promising DCAF parliamentary capacity-building activities of the first decade of the third millennium. Not only did the CIS PA adopt this first Model Law, but further cooperation led to a number of investigations and seminars whose fruit we gladly present herewith again.

Geneva, July 2012

Philipp Fluri, Ph.D. Deputy Director DCAF

CONTENTS

On the Parliamentary Oversight of the State Military
Organisation1
Article 1: Terms and Definitions2
Article 2: Forms of Execution of the Parliamentary Oversight of the State Military Organisation5
Article 3: Implementation of Legislative Functions of the Parliament on Exercising Oversight of the Military Organisation7
Article 4: Implementation of the Functions and Powers of the Parliament in the Field of Oversight of the Financing of the State Military Organisation
Article 5: Implementation of Functions and Powers of the Parliament in the Field of Defining the Composition, Structure and Manpower of Armed Forces, Troops, Para-Military Units and Bodies that are Part of the State Military Organisation
Article 6: Implementation of Functions and Powers of the Parliament on Ensuring Transparency of the State Military Organisation and its Activities10
Article 7: Implementation of Functions and Powers of the Parliament on Ensuring Political Neutrality (De-Politicisation) of the State Military Organisation
Article 8: Implementation of the Functions and Powers of the Parliament in the Field of Deployment of Military Personnel for Participation in International Peace-Keeping Operations and for Participation in Military Operations Outside of State Borders in Peace-Time
Supplement
Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the Military Organisation13

COMMONWEALTH OF INDEPENDENT STATES (CIS)

MODEL LAW

ON THE PARLIAMENTARY OVERSIGHT OF THE STATE MILITARY ORGANISATION $^{\rm 1}$

Adopted by the 18th Plenary Session of the Inter-Parliamentary Assembly of the Participant States of the CIS (Resolution No. 18-13 of 24th November 2001)

The present Law ² specifies forms of implementation of powers and functions of the Parliament in the field of democratic civilian oversight of the military organisation of a CIS participant state. The present Law is a recommendation and serves as a basis for the legislative activities of CIS participant states regarding the establishment and the implementation of this oversight.

The parliamentary oversight is regarded by the present Law as the central component of a broader democratic civilian oversight of the state military organisation.

The present Law regulates the nature, objectives, forms, and methods of the parliamentary oversight of the state military organisation.

¹ The Model Law "On the Parliamentary Oversight of the State Military Organisation" was drafted and submitted to the Inter-Parliamentary Assembly of the Participant States of the Commonwealth of Independent States jointly by the Geneva Centre for Democratic Control of Armed Forces (DCAF), Switzerland, and the Centre for Political and International Studies, Moscow, Russia.

² Here and hereinafter, the expression "*the present Law*" means the Model Law "On the Parliamentary Oversight of the State Military Organisation," adopted by the 18th Plenary Session of the Inter-Parliamentary Assembly of the Participant States of the Commonwealth of Independent States (Resolution No.18-13 of 24th November 2001).

<u>Article 1</u> Terms and Definitions

1. The *state military organisation* is the aggregate of bodies and organisations of the executive power established and operating in compliance with the Constitution and laws (of the CIS participant state); aimed at providing the security of individual, society, and state; authorized to use force and military action and/or to conduct special operations within the framework and in cases established by law. The composition and the structure of the state military organisation shall be specified by law and shall be brought into accordance with the state's international obligations.

Depending on the nature and the details of the constitutional system of specific CIS participant states, the state military organisation may include:

- armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies aimed at repelling external aggression and other threats associated with the use of external military force against the given state or with the implementation of the state's international obligations;
- b. internal troops, other para-military units and bodies aimed at protecting constitutional order, putting an end to disorder, providing and ensuring public order and internal security, fighting terrorism, and protecting state secrets;
- c. border troops;
- d. bodies and para-military units aimed at fighting crime;
- e. bodies of state intelligence and counter-intelligence;
- f. bodies and para-military units aimed at providing government communications;
- g. bodies and troops of civil defence, military transport, as well as bodies and troops aimed at dealing with emergency situations of an environmental/ecological, and social/humanitarian nature;
- h. special units established for wartime.

Para-military organisations and units that are not part of the state military organisation, as specified legislatively (by the CIS participant state), shall be declared as illegal by law.

- 2. The *parliamentary oversight of the state military organisation*—a key component of democratic civilian oversight—is regarded in the context of the present Law as activities aimed at the establishment and the insurance of the adequate application of the system of legal provisions and administrative measures put in place by the Parliament in cooperation with other bodies of state power and institutions of the civil society pursuing the following goals:
 - a. to ensure effective oversight of armed forces, troops, paramilitary units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, by the supreme institutions of civilian political power in order to ensure security and protection of national interests;
 - b. to ensure political neutrality (de-politicisation) of armed forces, troops, paramilitary units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation;
 - c. to ensure de-ideologisation of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation;
 - d. to shape the state military organisation as an integral part of a law-abiding state, of the protection of civil rights and social interests of individuals active within the state military organisation and their family members, of the adaptation to civilian life of servicemen released from active duty and of the protection of their rights and interests;
 - e. to ensure maximum permissible transparency of the state military organisation; to ensure a constructive exchange of information between the state military organisation and the mass media and public organisations aiming to assist in the protection of civil, social, and personal rights and the interests of individuals active within the state military organisation and their family members, as well as of servicemen released from active duty.
- 3. The *political neutrality* (de-politicisation) of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation in the context of the parliamentary oversight implies the insurance of the respect of the following norms by legislative means:

- a. political parties, public movements and organisations shall be prohibited from involving servicemen and personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies in their activity, nor shall they establish para-military and armed units and organisations under their own control;
- b. servicemen and personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, shall unconditionally obey the instructions and orders of the legitimate state leadership which has been elected, approved, or formed in compliance with the procedures specified by the Constitution and laws (of the CIS participant state), irrespective of the political and ideological orientation of this state leadership;
- c. servicemen and personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, shall not have the right to engage in any political activity that exceeds the limits specified by the terms of their service; nor shall they have the right to be directed, in their service activities, by incentives, instructions, and decisions of political parties, and public movements; nor shall they be members of political parties and political movements; nor shall they cooperate with them, assist them in their activities, or participate in political propaganda and agitation;
- d. the establishment of political organisations and activities of political parties and movements shall be forbidden within armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation;
- e. servicemen and civilian personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, shall not be restricted from being posted to positions, nor shall they be dismissed therefrom due to political motives, provided that the requirements of political neutrality specified by the present Article have been met.
- 4. The *de-ideologisation* of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, means the prevention, by legal and administrative measures, of servicemen and personnel of these forces, troops, units and bodies from being directed in their service and professional activities by ideo-

logical, political, personal, and religious views and beliefs, when these views and beliefs contradict the Constitution and laws, service instructions, orders or directives specifying the terms of their service.

- 5. The *political activity* in the context of the present Law is regarded as:
 - a. individual or collective actions aimed at influencing institutions and bodies of state power for implementing individual, group, and institutional interests that are beyond the limits specified by the terms of the military service;
 - b. individual or collective actions aimed at forming and changing the political will of citizens;
 - c. participation in the work of bodies of state power or local selfgovernment in elected positions;
 - d. assistance to individuals, political parties, public movements, organisations and associations participating in the elections to bodies of state power or local selfgovernment and in conducting political propaganda and agitation;
 - e. membership in an organisation conducting political activities, in accordance with the definition given in the afore-mentioned paragraphs of the present Article, cooperation with such an organisation, or providing assistance to it.

<u>Article 2</u>

Forms of Execution of the Parliamentary Oversight of the State Military Organisation (of the CIS Participant State)

- 1. The Parliament (of the CIS participant state) shall execute oversight of the military organisation (of the CIS participant state) by means of:
 - a. adoption of laws specifying mechanisms and procedures of administration of the state military organisation, its functioning, and cooperation with civilian institutions of state power, public organisations, and mass media; guaranteeing the protection of civil, social, and personal rights of servicemen and personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, and ensuring their social interests;

- b. approval of the budget of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, as well as oversight of its execution and of the use of non-budgetary sources for financing activities of the state military organisation;
- c. approval of the composition, structure, and manpower of servicemen and personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation;
- d. ratification and denunciation of international agreements and treaties which contain obligations on the restriction and reduction of arms and of armed forces, as well as on the use and restriction of the use of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation;
- e. assessment of key issues in ensuring the security of individual, society, and state, as well as the functioning of the state military organisation and its constituent parts in the form of parliamentary hearings, deputies' inquiries, and investigations;
- f. legislative regulation of the respect of civil, social, and personal rights and the interests of servicemen and personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, as well as assessment and implementation of proposals given by citizens, public organisations, mass-media, relating to activities of the state military organisation, respect of civil, social, and personal rights of servicemen and personnel of forces, troops, units and bodies that are part of this organisation;
- g. assessment and evaluation of military and political situations, approval of imposition and lifting of the state of emergency and martial law, declaration of the state of war and the conclusion of peace;
- h. legislative regulation of the use of armed forces, troops, paramilitary units and bodies beyond national borders (of the CIS participant state) and of the presence of armed forces of other states within national borders (of the CIS participant state).

6

<u>Article 3</u> Implementation of Legislative Functions of the Parliament on Exercising Oversight of the Military Organisation (of the CIS Participant State)

- 1. The Parliament (of the CIS participant state) shall adopt, in compliance with the procedure established by the Constitution (of the CIS participant state), laws regulating and specifying the system of administration of the state military organisation; powers and functions of institutions and bodies of state power on the administration of this organisation; the procedure for the use of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of this organisation, as well as objectives, tasks, and powers of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation. The Parliament shall ensure legislative guarantees of the respect of civil, social, and personal rights of servicemen and personnel of these forces, troops, units, and bodies, and shall regulate other issues of the functioning of the state military organisation and its administration.
- 2. When elaborating and adopting legislative norms related to the issues listed in Paragraph 1 of the present Article, and administering oversight of their execution, the Parliament shall, in particular:
 - a. prohibit the establishment, functioning and the existence of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are not part of the state military organisation, are not subordinate to the constitutionally established bodies of state power and not controlled by them;
 - b. create legal conditions under which armed forces, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, cannot act in contradiction to the laws according to which these forces, troops, units and bodies were established;
 - c. create legal foundations for invoking personal service and criminal responsibility of individuals in positions of command for giving orders and instructions that contradict the Constitution, national legislation (of the CIS participant state), and/ or international law;

- d. legislatively ensure political neutrality of the state military organisation and its de-ideologisation;
- e. legislatively establish that trying of civil and criminal court cases other than service offences, but involving servicemen and other personnel of the state military organisation, shall fall into the jurisdiction of civilian courts acting on the basis of the corresponding legislation.

<u>Article 4</u>

Implementation of the Functions and Powers of the Parliament in the Field of Oversight of the Financing of the State Military Organisation

- 1. After proposal by the Government (or by the Head of State), the Parliament shall make a decision on procedure, structure, and amount of funding from the state budget for armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, as well as on permissibility, forms, and amount of non-budgetary sources of financing.
- 2. The Parliament shall request, and the Government (or the Head of State) shall provide the Parliament with information, including classified information, necessary for making a learned and competent decision on the financing of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation.
- 3. Information on the general structure and specific amount of budgetary allocations for the activities and development of the state military organisation, including the distribution of budgetary allocations between sections and groups of articles of the budget that relate to national defence and security, shall be un-classified information.

Sections and articles of the state budget relating to the financing of the state military organisation may be identified as classified, not subject for public discussion and disclosure only on the basis of a law on classified information, if their contents directly corresponds to the lists of types of information not subject to disclosure, as established in the law on classified information. Such sections and articles shall be discussed and approved in closed sessions of the Parliament.

- 4. The use of state budget funds, allocated for the financing of the state military organisation for other purposes beyond the framework of ensuring state security, maintenance, and development of the state military organisation, shall be prohibited.
- 5. For the purposes of oversight of the correlation of the real spending with the approved budgetary allocations, the Parliament shall request and the Government (or the Head of State) shall provide an annual report on the execution of the state budget regarding the financing of the state military organisation.

The Government (or the Head of State) shall also provide the Parliament with all the information on the current material and financial status of the state military organisation, necessary for a learned and competent evaluation of the state of affairs of the state military organisation.

<u>Article 5</u>

Implementation of Functions and Powers of the Parliament in the Field of Defining the Composition, Structure and Manpower of Armed Forces, Troops, Para-Military Units and Bodies that are Part of the State Military Organisation

- 1. After proposal by the Government (or by the Head of State), the Parliament shall make a decision on the composition, structure, and manpower of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation.
- 2. The Parliament shall request, and the Government (or the Head of State) shall provide the Parliament with information, including classified information, necessary for making a learned and competent decision on the composition, structure, and manpower of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, including information relating to their actual composition and actual (en-listed) manpower.

<u>Article 6</u> Implementation of Functions and Powers of the Parliament on Ensuring Transparency of the State Military Organisation and its Activities

- 1. After proposal by the Government (or by the Head of State), the Parliament shall adopt a law on classified information, containing a comprehensive list of information related to the state military organisation that is prohibited for publication in the mass media or for disclosure by any other means.
- 2. The Parliament shall legislatively establish a list of information relating to the state military organisation that is subject to compulsory disclosure, including publication in the mass media, allowing for the citizens and tax-payers to form a competent and learned opinion on the state of affairs and on the status of the state military organisation.
- 3. The list of information mentioned in Paragraph 2 of Article 6 shall include, in particular, all information relating to the state military organisation and its functioning that is subject to be submitted to international organisations and foreign states within the framework of current international treaty obligations and international agreements (of the CIS participant state).
- 4. The Parliament shall ensure personal responsibility of parliamentarians for nondisclosure of classified information provided to the members of Parliament in the course of discussion of the issues of composition, structure, manpower, and financing of the state military organisation.

<u>Article 7</u>

10

Implementation of Functions and Powers of the Parliament on Ensuring Political Neutrality (De-politicisation) of the State Military Organisation

1. Laws specifying the status and rights of servicemen and personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, as well as laws regulating the activities of public movements and political parties, shall be supplemented by provisions ensuring political neutrality (depoliticisation) of the state military organisation, servicemen, and personnel of forces, troops, units and bodies that are part of this organisation.

- 2. Should a case arise where political parties and public movements violate requirements of political neutrality (de-politicisation) of the state military organisation, as specified in Paragraph 3 of Article 1, the Parliament shall invoke judicial authorities to impose sanctions on violations of political parties and public movements, and affect their prohibition.
- 3. Should there be a case where servicemen and civilian personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, violate requirements of political neutrality of the state military organisation, as specified in Paragraph 3 of Article 1, or where they directly participate in political activity, as specified in Paragraph 5 of Article 1, the Parliament shall demand immediate action from the leadership of the state military organisation to cease the violations and to ensure the unconditional respect of political neutrality of the state military organisation.
- 4. The Parliament shall ensure legislative guarantees to servicemen, who practice a religious faith, regarding the opportunity to participate in religious ceremonies and rituals during non-duty hours.

Article 8

Implementation of the Functions and Powers of the Parliament in the Field of Deployment of Military Personnel for Participation in International Peace-Keeping Operations and for Participation in Military Operations Outside of State Borders in Peace-Time

- 1. Deployment abroad of military personnel who are part of the state military organisation, for conducting operations outside of state borders in peace-time shall only be allowed when the Parliament has been informed and agrees thereto in accordance with the procedures established (in the CIS participant state), in the following cases:
 - ✓ for participating in international peace-keeping operations under the mandate of the United Nations Organisation (in ac-

12

cordance with the provisions stated in Chapter VI of the UN Charter);

- ✓ for participating in regional international peace-keeping operations decided upon by a regional inter-state organisation (in accordance with the provisions stated in Chapters VI and VIII of the UN Charter);
- ✓ for participating in the execution of enforcement measures decided upon by the UN Security Council in the case of threats to the peace, breach of the peace, or acts of aggression (in accordance with the provisions stated in Chapter VII of the UN Charter);
- ✓ for providing humanitarian assistance, as well as assistance in emergency situations;
- ✓ for implementing international treaties and agreements, including those on providing military and military-technical assistance, concluded by the given state and ratified by the Parliament.
- 2. Deployment abroad of military personnel who are part of the state military organisation, for conducting operations outside of state borders during peace-time in cases other than those specified in Paragraph 1 of the present Article, or without the corresponding decision of the Parliament (of the CIS participant state), shall be prohibited.

Supplement

The institution of the Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the State Military Organisation may be legislatively established and used as one of the specific mechanisms of implementation of the parliamentary oversight.

Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the Military Organisation (of the CIS participant state)

- 1. (CIS participant state) may legislatively establish the institution of the Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the State Military Organisation.
- 2. The Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the State Military Organisation shall be appointed by the Parliament.
- 3. The Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the State Military Organisation shall be exclusively directed in his activities by the Constitution and laws (of the CIS participant state), as well as by international law.
- 4. The Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the State Military Organisation shall report periodically, or as required, to the Head of State and to the Parliament on the state of affairs of the state military organisation, as well as on his own activities.
- 5. Tasks of the Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the State Military Organisation shall include:
 - a. providing practical assistance in ensuring guarantees of civil, social, and personal rights of servicemen and personnel of armed forces, troops, paramilitary units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation;
 - b. ensuring constructive cooperation between, on the one hand, armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, and on the other hand, citizens, public organisations, and mass media;

14

- c. overseeing the respect of requirements for political neutrality and of the prevention of political activity within the state military organisation.
- 6. For the purposes provided for by Paragraph 5 of the present Article, the Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the State Military Organisation shall have the right:
 - a. to request and receive information, documents and records, necessary for performing tasks specified in the present Article, from commanders and officials of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, as well as from the institutions of state power;
 - b. to examine complaints by servicemen and personnel of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, regarding the violation of their civil, social, and personal rights by commanders and officials of the corresponding forces, troops, units, and bodies; to make the corresponding inquiries and proposals;
 - c. to examine requests and proposals by citizens, public organisations, and mass media regarding activities of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, and, within this context, to submit questions and proposals to officials of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, as well as to other institutions of state power;
 - d. to demand answers to the core of questions, mentioned in afore-mentioned paragraphs of the present Article, from commanders and officials of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, as well as from other institutions of state power.
- 7. Commanders and officials of armed forces, troops, para-military units and bodies that are part of the state military organisation, and other institutions of state power shall provide the Parliamentary (State) Commissioner on the Affairs of the State Military Organisation with information, documents and records, necessary for performing tasks specified in the present Article, and shall further,

within the time provided for by procedures and rules of the state administrative system, give answers to the core of questions that have been posed. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be produced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces.

This publication is circulated subject to the condition that it shall not by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, sold, hired out or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form of binding or cover other than in which it is published and without a similar condition including this condition being imposed on the subsequent publisher.

Philipp Fluri and Alexander Nikitin, eds., *On the Parliamentary Oversight of the State Military Organisation: CIS Model Law*, Second edition (Geneva: Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces, 2012).

Original Version: English, 2002

Cover Design: Angel Nedelchev Format: 6.25 x 9 ISBN 978-92-9222-207-9